

COOKIE MONSTER PROTOCOL

Purpose

To explore rubric creation and scoring to better understand rubric use in schools and classrooms.

Planning

- **Time:** 45 minutes including completion of Cookie Mindset step.
- **Roles:** Facilitator, timekeeper, recorder (fills in chart), and reporter (shares data with group).
- **Preparation:** Bake, buy, or beg for 3–4 different kinds of chocolate chip cookies to sample, and label each cookie A, B, C, and D. Prepare a large chart for each reporting group.

Process

- 1 Cookie Qualities—What makes a good cookie?** Brainstorm the qualities of a good chocolate chip cookie and write them on chart paper. (5 minutes)
- 2 Cookie Rubric—What’s essential?** Create a rubric using the three most important qualities the group has identified. Create performance levels for the three criteria using a 4-point scale and fill in as many levels as time allows, starting with the proficient level. Try to provide as much detail as possible for scoring the cookies. (10 minutes)

Level	4	3 (Proficient)	2	1
Cookie Quality:				

- 3 Cookie Scoring—How good are they?** Each group uses the criteria created to score several different cookies, starting with A. Score as many cookies as time allows, coming to consensus on your scores. Recorder should chart all scores and be prepared to present the group’s criteria and the score for each cookie. (10 minutes)
- 4 Whole Group Sharing—What’s the score?** The reporter shares the criteria and total score for each cookie out of the 12 possible points each cookie could earn for the three criteria on a 4-point scale. (60 seconds or less per group)
- 5 Whole Group Debrief—How the cookie crumbles.** End with whole group debrief of the process and the implications for rubric creation.



COOKIE MONSTER MINDSET

Cookie Monster Protocol Part 2

Applying the chocolate chip cookie mindset (15-20 minutes)

After the group sharing, ask:

- Are all criteria equally important?
- How should uneven performance in different rubric criteria be addressed? For example, what if a cookie has a high score in number of chips or size, but a low score in taste? Does that matter?
- What are the implications for rubrics we use in our classes/courses?

There are five different types of criteria used in rubrics, and not all have to be included all of the time. When you create a rubric, keep these criteria types in mind, and consider whether some are more essential than others:

1. **Process criteria**—Did you follow the right steps (e.g., scientific investigation; data collection; developing an outline; following a routine)?
2. **Form criteria**—Did you apply correct formats and rules (e.g., handed in on time; correct citation format; correctly labeled; organized properly)?
3. **Accuracy of content criteria**—That is, is the answer correct; is the right relationship explained; is the concept understood or accurately applied?
4. **New knowledge criteria**—Did the student go beyond the accurate solution and correct process to gain new insights, raise new questions?
5. **Impact criteria**—Did the final product achieve its intended purpose (e.g., solved a problem; persuaded the audience; synthesized information)?

Now analyze your group's cookie rubric criteria using the above criteria types—and determine if some are more important, given the task. This might be an important consideration when determining the weighting of each rubric criterion.